

MEMO City of Venice Engineering Department

То:	Edward Lavallee, City Manager
Thru:	Kathleen J. Weeden, PE, City Engineer
From:	James Clinch, PE, Asst. City Engineer
Date:	11/04/16
Subject:	November 30, 2016 City Council Agenda Osprey Ditch Safety Assessment

History:

The Osprey Ditch is an 8 to 10 ft. deep open drainage ditch which runs alongside Osprey Street, a residential roadway with a posted speed limit of 25 mph (Exhibit A). Osprey Ditch was originally an open drainage ditch with vegetated sides and no curb, but was redesigned and reconstructed in 1996 by Sarasota County to have concrete fabric mat sides and an 8" high-back curb for vehicular protection. There is a pedestrian rail at the north end at the intersection of Laguna Dr. (Exhibit B.1) and there are guard rails on the southern end at the intersection of Apalachicola Rd. (Exhibit B.2).

After the reconstruction was completed, the maintenance responsibility of the ditch was turned over to the City in 1997, however it was not until the road was repaved in 2015 and an amendment to the Sarasota County Road Transfer Agreement was executed in June 2016 that the roadway and ditch became City ownership.

City Council has requested that a safety assessment be performed on this ditch location to see if the current layout justifies the need for additional safety measures such as, fencing, guard-rails or pedestrian rails.

Safety Assessment:

In an effort to assess the safety of this facility the City Engineering Department has coordinated with the following agencies and individuals and the responses are summarized below:

 <u>Venice Police Department (Exhibit C)</u>: The Venice Police Department reviewed the crash history for this area and confirmed that there are no recorded vehicular crashes or incidents associated with this facility.

- 2) Florida Department of Transportation, Chris Smith, Director of Transportation Development (Exhibit D): FDOT offered suggestions that the crash history should be reviewed first and that the roadway could remain in its current state if there was no crash history to support the change. They also suggested that if desired, a fence, barrier or warning signs could be installed for additional protection.
- 3) Florida League of Cities, Kenneth Blaser, Risk Control Consultant (Exhibit E): Mr. Blaser sent over the current FDOT Design Standards for review. The current Florida Green-Book requires 1.5 ft. of clear zone from the face of curb. Osprey St. currently has 2.5' of clear zone provided in addition to a larger than normal 8" high curbing.
- 4) Original Engineer of Record for the 1996 Design, Mitch McKnight, PE (Exhibit F): Mr. McKnight explained that this project actually exceeded, slightly, the FDOT Green-Book requirements for clear zone in 1996 by providing an 8" high curb instead of 6" and by providing 2.5' of horizontal clearance from face of curb instead of the required 1.5'. He also said that the Green-Book does allow for the installation of shielding in situations such as this if desired.

In summary, the Osprey St. roadway and ditch were designed to meet the appropriate safety standards at the time of construction. There have been no crashes to date which have involved this facility and this would support leaving the facility in it's current condition. It is worth noting however, that if the roadway were being constructed today, Engineering would consider installing a barrier at this location simply due to the steepness of the slope and the potential hazard.

The City Engineering Dept. did perform citizen polling of all surrounding neighbors which is summarized in the attached exhibit and resident petitions (Exhibit G). The overall consensus was that residents were opposed to the addition of any railing or guardrail and much preferred the ditch to be enclosed with underground piping. If the underground piping is not financially feasible, the majority preferred the facility to be left in its existing condition.

Osprey Ditch Options:

- Leave Facility "As-Designed": Leave the facility in its current condition
 ➢ Cost Estimate: \$0
- 2) <u>Guard Rail</u>: Shielded vehicular protection → <u>Cost Estimate:</u> \$32,000
- Cc: James Clinch, Assistant City Engineer John Monville, Stormwater Engineer Cathy Dubre, Projects Coordinator



2000 earth	feet	1000
Joogie earth	meters	300

(











From:	Kathleen Weeden
Sent:	Wednesday, October 26, 2016 4:14 PM
То:	James Clinch
Cc:	Mike Rose
Subject:	Fw: Osprey Ave

Crash report from Chief

From: Tom Mattmuller Sent: Tuesday, July 5, 2016 4:10:12 PM To: Edward Lavallee; Kathleen Weeden Cc: Judy Gamel Subject: Osprey Ave

No record of traffic crashes on Osprey Ave

PLEASE NOTE: This

agency is a public entity and is subject to Chapter 119, Florida Statutes, concerning public records. Email communications are covered under such laws; therefore, email sent or received on this entity's computer system, including your email address, may be disclosed to the public and media upon request. If you do not want your email address released to a public records request, do not send electronic mail to this entity. Instead, contact this office by phone or in writing.

___Need to Report an Issue? SeeClickFix Venice Connect is available as an app for Android and iPhone. Select SeeClickFix from your app store on your device and choose Venice, Florida. There is also a link to the program on the city's website, www.venicegov.com, or go directly to SeeClickFix at http://www.seeclickfix.com/Venice

PLEASE NOTE: This agency is a public entity and is subject to Chapter 119, Florida Statutes, concerning public records. Email communications are covered under such laws; therefore, email sent or received on this entity's computer system, including your email address, may be disclosed to the public and media upon request. If you do not want your email address released to a public records request, do not send electronic mail to this entity. Instead, contact this office by phone or in writing.



From:	Smith, Chris < Chris.Smith@dot.state.fl.us>	
Sent:	Thursday, September 22, 2016 5:13 PM	
То:	James Clinch; Kathleen Weeden	
Cc:	Nandam, L. K.	
Subject:	RE: Osprey Ditch Safety Concerns.	

James, the FDOT District Design Engineer and his staff looked at the information you provided and they offer some suggestions that the City might consider for treatment of the ditch.

- 1) City of Venice should research crash history. If they have concerns, they could replace the open ditch with an enclosed drainage system and mitigate, if necessary.
- 2) From a practical design standpoint, they could just let it remain in its current state if there is no crash history.
- 3) City could fence the property to prevent pedestrian intrusion.
- 4) City could place a barrier such as guardrail or a wall to prevent pedestrians and/or errant vehicles from entering ditch.
- 5) City could post no trespassing signs or some type of warning signs on the ditch berm adjacent to the street.

We hope we were of service to you and the City of Venice.

Chris Smith Director of Transportation Development Office (863) 519-2611 Cell (863) 640-9545



From: James Clinch [mailto:JClinch@Venicegov.com] Sent: Wednesday, September 14, 2016 1:41 PM To: Kathleen Weeden; Smith, Chris Subject: RE: Osprey Ditch Safety Concerns.

Chris,

Thank you for the assistance. We have an 8-10 ft. deep, open drainage ditch which runs alongside Osprey St. in Venice (see attached). It was originally an open ditch with vegetated sides and no curb, but was redesigned and reconstructed in 1996, to have concrete fabric mat sides and an 8" high-back curb. There are guard rails on the southern side at the road intersection and there is a pedestrian rail at the north end. Beyond that, the long center stretch just has the curb to prevent vehicular access. There have been no known vehicular or pedestrian incidents do date, however the concern is that perhaps there could be a pedestrian accident during a rainstorm when the ditch is flowing swiftly.

Council had requested a 3rd party review, to assess what the actual level of risk is of this facility.

Please let us know if you need any additional information, Thanks.

James R. Clinch, P.E. CFM Assistant City Engineer

From: Kathleen Weeden
Sent: Wednesday, September 14, 2016 1:40 PM
To: Smith, Chris <<u>Chris.Smith@dot.state.fl.us</u>>; James Clinch <<u>JClinch@Venicegov.com</u>>
Subject: RE: Osprey Ditch Safety Concerns.

Chris,

Thank you for your assistance. I am out of the office for the remainder of the week, but I have asked James Clinch, Asst. City Engineer, to provide the information regarding Osprey Ditch.

I look forward to any engineering evaluation assistance you can provide. City Council has asked us to obtain outside evaluation of the ditch.

Kathleen

Kathleen J. Weeden, PE, CFM, LEED AP City Engineer 401 W. Venice Avenue Venice, FL 34285 941-882-7409 941-468-2669 (cell)

From: Smith, Chris [mailto:Chris.Smith@dot.state.fl.us]
Sent: Wednesday, September 14, 2016 11:05 AM
To: Robert Daniels <<u>RDaniels@Venicegov.com</u>>
Cc: Edward Lavallee <<u>ELavallee@Venicegov.com</u>>; James Clinch <<u>JClinch@Venicegov.com</u>>; Kathleen Weeden
<<u>KWeeden@Venicegov.com</u>>; Nandam, L. K. <<u>L.Nandam@dot.state.fl.us</u>>
Subject: RE: Osprey Ditch Safety Concerns.

Thanks Mr. Daniels. I look forward to hearing from her.

Chris Smith Director of Transportation Development Office (863) 519-2611 Cell (863) 640-9545



From: Robert Daniels [mailto:RDaniels@Venicegov.com]
Sent: Wednesday, September 14, 2016 8:51 AM
To: Smith, Chris
Cc: Edward Lavallee; Robert Daniels; James Clinch; Kathleen Weeden
Subject: Osprey Ditch Safety Concerns.

Chris, I am going to let our city engineer Kathleen contact you about this issue. Thanks for the quick response . Get <u>Outlook for iOS</u>

On Wed, Sep 14, 2016 at 8:09 AM -0400, "Smith, Chris" <<u>Chris.Smith@dot.state.fl.us</u>> wrote:

Just looking for some information on what your need is so if you would call me, I'd be glad to speak with you and get you in touch with the right staff member.

Chris Smith Director of Transportation Development Office (863) 519-2611 Cell (863) 640-9545



From: Nandam, L. K. Sent: Tuesday, September 13, 2016 6:47 PM To: Smith, Chris Subject: Fwd: FDOT Help

Chris:

Please see email from Councilman Daniels. Can you have Brent look into and see if we can do anything. I am not sure what he is looking for though.

Thanks

LK

L. K. Nandam, P. E. Director of Transportation Operations Florida Department of Transportation District 1 Phone: (863) 519-2202 Cell: (863) 640-5049 <u>I.nandam@dot.state.fl.us</u>

SEATBELTS SAVE LIVES!

------ Forwarded message ------From: "**Robert Daniels**" <<u>RDaniels@Venicegov.com</u>> Date: Tue, Sep 13, 2016 at 6:35 PM -0400 Subject: FDOT Help To: "Nandam, L. K." <<u>L.Nandam@dot.state.fl.us</u>> Cc: "Dave Hutchinson" <<u>Dave@mympo.org</u>>, "Robert Daniels" <<u>RDaniels@Venicegov.com</u>>, "Edward Lavallee" <<u>ELavallee@Venicegov.com</u>>, "James Clinch" <<u>JClinch@Venicegov.com</u>>, "Kathleen Weeden" <<u>KWeeden@Venicegov.com</u>>

L.K., Venice has a rather large storm ditch than drains into Donna Bay in which our engineering department would to have some ideas from your transportation engineers.

Get Outlook for iOS

_____Need to Report an Issue? SeeClickFix Venice Connect is available as an app for Android and iPhone. Select SeeClickFix from your app store on your device and choose Venice, Florida. There is also a link to the program on the city's website, <u>www.venicegov.com</u>, or go directly to SeeClickFix at <u>http://www.seeclickfix.com/Venice</u>_____PLEASE

NOTE: This agency is a public entity and is subject to Chapter 119, Florida Statutes, concerning public records. Email communications are covered under such laws; therefore, email sent or received on this entity's computer system, including your email address, may be disclosed to the public and media upon request. If you do not want your email address released to a public records request, do not send electronic mail to this entity. Instead, contact this office by phone or in writing.

_____Need to Report an Issue? SeeClickFix Venice Connect is available as an app for Android and iPhone. Select SeeClickFix from your app store on your device and choose Venice, Florida. There is also a link to the program on the city's website, <u>www.venicegov.com</u>, or go directly to SeeClickFix at <u>http://www.seeclickfix.com/Venice</u>_____PLEASE

NOTE: This agency is a public entity and is subject to Chapter 119, Florida Statutes, concerning public records. Email communications are covered under such laws; therefore, email sent or received on this entity's computer system, including your email address, may be disclosed to the public and media upon request. If you do not want your email address released to a public records request, do not send electronic mail to this entity. Instead, contact this office by phone or in writing.



From:	Ken Blaser <kblaser@flcities.com></kblaser@flcities.com>
Sent:	Monday, September 19, 2016 11:45 AM
То:	James Clinch
Subject:	RE: Safety Assessment Consultants - Osprey Ditch
Attachments:	DrainageManual.pdf; Plans Preparation Manual Chap04.pdf; FloridaGreenbook.pdf

The Drainage Manual under Roadside Safety refers to the Plans Preparation Manual as does the Greenbook.

Hope this information of assistance.

Kenneth J. Blaser

Risk Control Consultant Florida League of Cities 407-405-5619

From: James Clinch [mailto:JClinch@Venicegov.com]
Sent: Monday, September 19, 2016 11:36 AM
To: Ken Blaser <KBlaser@flcities.com>
Subject: RE: Safety Assessment Consultants - Osprey Ditch

Ken,

You may contact me at either of the numbers below. Thanks!

James R. Clinch, P.E. CFM

Assistant City Engineer City of Venice 401 West Venice Avenue Venice, Fl 34285 Office: (941) 882-7410 Cell: (941) 234-6059

From: Ken Blaser [mailto:KBlaser@flcities.com]
Sent: Monday, September 19, 2016 11:33 AM
To: James Clinch <JClinch@Venicegov.com>
Subject: RE: Safety Assessment Consultants - Osprey Ditch

Mr. Clinch:

I would appreciate a phone number by which to contact you.

From: James Clinch [mailto:JClinch@Venicegov.com]
Sent: Wednesday, September 14, 2016 12:46 PM
To: Alan Bullock <<u>ABullock@Venicegov.com</u>>; Ken Blaser <<u>KBlaser@flcities.com</u>>
Cc: Kathleen Weeden <<u>KWeeden@Venicegov.com</u>>
Subject: RE: Safety Assessment Consultants - Osprey Ditch

Ken,

Thank you for the assistance. We have an 8-10 ft. deep, open drainage ditch which runs alongside Osprey St. in Venice (see attached). It was originally an open ditch with vegetated sides and no curb, but was redesigned and reconstructed in 1996, to have concrete fabric mat sides and an 8" high-back curb. There are guard rails on the southern side at the road intersection and there is a pedestrian rail at the north end. Beyond that, the long center stretch just has the curb to prevent vehicular access. There have been no known vehicular or pedestrian incidents do date, however the concern is that perhaps there could be a pedestrian accident during a rainstorm when the ditch is flowing swiftly.

Council had requested a 3rd party review, to assess what the actual level of risk is of this facility.

Please let us know if you need any additional information, Thanks.

James R. Clinch, P.E. CFM Assistant City Engineer

From: Alan Bullock
Sent: Tuesday, September 13, 2016 4:37 PM
To: Ken Blaser <<u>KBlaser@flcities.com</u>>; James Clinch <<u>JClinch@Venicegov.com</u>>
Subject: RE: Safety Assessment Consultants - Osprey Ditch

Ken – City point of contact on this is James Clinch. James – Please oblige.

Thanks,

Alan Bullock Director of Administrative Services 941-486-2626, ext. 7377 941-882-7377 (direct line)

Serving the City of Venice with PRIDE: Productive – Responsible – Innovative – Dedicated – Ethical

From: Ken Blaser [mailto:KBlaser@flcities.com]
Sent: Tuesday, September 13, 2016 4:32 PM
To: Alan Bullock <<u>ABullock@Venicegov.com</u>>
Subject: RE: Safety Assessment Consultants - Osprey Ditch

If you could forward some details on the project, I would be glad to look at it and see if I can be of assistance.

From: Alan Bullock [mailto:ABullock@Venicegov.com]
Sent: Tuesday, September 13, 2016 3:50 PM
To: James Clinch <JClinch@Venicegov.com>
Cc: Kathleen Weeden <KWeeden@Venicegov.com>; John Monville <JMonville@Venicegov.com>; Ken Blaser
<KBlaser@flcities.com>
Subject: RE: Safety Assessment Consultants - Osprey Ditch

Maybe something our insurance carrier can assist with - Ken? (Ken Blaser - FL League of Cities)



From:	Mitch McKnight <mmcknight@halfacreco.com></mmcknight@halfacreco.com>
Sent:	Tuesday, October 11, 2016 3:38 PM
То:	James Clinch
Cc:	Kathleen Weeden; John Monville
Subject:	Re: City of Venice - Osprey Ditch Safety Concerns

This project actually exceeded, slightly, the FDOT Green Book requirements for clear zone in 1996 by providing an 8" high curb instead of 6" and by providing 2.5' horizontal clearance from face of curb instead of the required 1.5'. Since that time the FHWA has stated that the difference between a "clear zone" and horizontal clearance has been a topic of much confusion. There is no precise number to be used for horizontal clearance. Realizing that there are still contradictory passages in various AASHTO documents, the FHWA has initiated a project to identify all such inconsistencies and to recommend appropriate language corrections. The FHWA now also recognizes that curbs generally have no significant containment or redirection capability.

That said, the fact that the posted speed limit is 25 mph and there have been no reported accidents here is a good fact for the City. If the City desires to install guardrail to help prevent any future accidents at this location the FL Green Book could be cited in support of that decision. It says the general policy to be followed for installation of guardrail is that guardrails should be used if impact with the guardrail is less likely or considered less severe than impact with the roadside object (i.e., the ditch)

Mitch McKnight, PE Halfacre Construction Company 7015 Professional Parkway East Sarasota, FL 34240 941-907-9099

From: James Clinch <JClinch@Venicegov.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 11, 2016 10:46 AM
To: Mitch McKnight
Cc: Kathleen Weeden; John Monville
Subject: City of Venice - Osprey Ditch Safety Concerns

Good Morning Mitchell,

Thank you very much for taking a look at this potential safety concern for the Osprey Ditch, located along Osprey St. in Venice. Having some input from the original Engineer of Record would be extremely beneficial to our alternative analysis as we decide what (if any) modification need to be made to increase safety.

Attached are the Record Drawings from the original project which was completed in 1996 and converted an existing dirt roadway and open channel ditch, into a paved roadway and ditch with fabric formed concrete side slopes. I have also attached two recent photos, so you can see the current conditions of the ditch. The original design included a 8 inch high F-curb along the ditch, presumably to provide some protection for traffic.

The current question from City Council is whether this curb alone is sufficient for vehicular and pedestrian protection along this ditch. The side slopes of the ditch are very steep at 1.5:1 slope, and it does carry high flow volumes during storm events. We are considering whether a safety concern actually exists and if so, does it warrant the installation of a guardrail or pedestrian rail.

Please let me know if you need any additional information or would like to meet in the field to discuss further.

Thank You,

James R. Clinch, P.E. CFM

Assistant City Engineer City of Venice 401 West Venice Avenue Venice, Fl 34285 Office: (941) 882-7410 Cell: (941) 234-6059

_____Need to Report an Issue? SeeClickFix Venice Connect is available as an app for Android and iPhone. Select SeeClickFix from your app store on your device and choose Venice, Florida. There is also a link to the program on the city's website, www.venicegov.com, or go directly to SeeClickFix at http://www.seeclickfix.com/Venice ______PLEASE NOTE: This agency is a public entity and is subject to Chapter 119, Florida Statutes, concerning public records. Email communications are covered under such laws; therefore, email sent or received on this entity's computer system, including your email address, may be disclosed to the public and media upon request. If you do not want your email address released to a public records request, do not send electronic mail to this entity. Instead, contact this office by phone or in writing.



Osprey Ditch Public Outreach

<u>August 2016</u>

We surveyed eight (8) individuals that border the Osprey ditch, the owners of the seven (7) residences and one (1) vacant lot.

We asked if they would like to see:

- (A) a guardrail similar to what is currently at the south end of the ditch
- (B) a Pedestrian rail similar to what is currently at the north end of the ditch
- (C) neither of the two and what their opinion was

Of those all eight (8) were surprised that it was not being filled in for safety reasons as they had heard about previously.

- One (1) wanted to see a pedestrian handrail and for safety was very surprised that it was not being filled.
- Seven (7) were opposed to either option (A) or (B)
 - Four (4) really want to see it filled in for safety and do not feel that either option (A) or (B) would provide adequate safety for pedestrians, cyclists, kids, and traffic.
 - One (1) feels that for some safety something must be done and if no other option wants (B) handrail.
 - One (1) feels that for some safety something must be done and either option (A) or (B) whichever is voted on by public.
 - One (1) feels that there is no safety concern, as years of service without incident have shown, he wants it left alone and does not want lots of money spent on something that he feels is unnecessary.

EXHIBIT G

Re: Osprey Stormwater Ditch along Osprey street.

At recent June & July 2016 City of Venice Council Meetings there were important changes for future plans regarding the Osprey Stormwater Ditch.

About three years ago the Venice City Council determined that there may be a safety issue regarding the open Osprey Stormwater Ditch. At that time the City Staff explored the expense to pipe and cover the ditch. Moving ahead with the plan, a 5 year CIP (Capitol Improvement Project) was Scheduled. The design was to be completed in 2017/2018, and construction to be completed 2018/2019.

Everything was moving along when in the recent June 2016 Council Meeting the project was proposed to be cut. Then in the next meeting a discussion was brought up to consider placing a guard rail all along Osprey Street.

The recent proposal from the Council is to get resident feedback on rail preferences with the cost not to exceed \$53,500. The two choices of rail type would be either a decorative hand-rail or a high-way type guard rail.

This proposed guard rail running along Osprey St. would diminish the overall pleasant aesthetics of our beautiful neighborhood as well as devalue property values. It would look ugly resembling what is seen along highways.

We as residents of this Venice neighborhood request that a guard rail is not needed since Osprey St. is a residential slow speed street, straight road with an existing 8-inch curb, and with no known past reports of vehicles in the ditch.

EXHIBIT G We as Venice Island residents do not want more guard rail to be installed along Osprey Street and the Osprey Ditch. This is a slow speed residential street, that is a straight road with an existing 8inch curb, and with no known past reports of vehicles in the ditch. Name and address Phone/email Signature Melissa e David Pinkham 941-923-935 Gils Tut 7 817 Filliteri P BOB + BUSAN 80 PILLISTEL PI. Scillenzon arow 801 Pilliteri John Williams Will Apalaitica Rd Mavin + Sue Miller 813 Lagra ARESONS TARPON CT.] JEAN We 644 Apolachian tide 700 1 tius 700 Has Thomas Go Anet Alor 6770 1555 TARDA

EXHIBIT G

We as Venice Island residents do not want more guard rail to be installed along Osprey Street and the Osprey Ditch.

This is a slow speed residential street, that is a straight road with an existing 8inch curb, and with no known past reports of vehicles in the ditch.

Name and address Phone/email Signature William Margon 629 Aps brilista (94) 485-2665 Les Margon Jane Morozan 629 Apelachizola 941 485-2665 Jone Killo Shaven Belterik 425 Apolochicola Rd 483-3140 Alubets certistorte 617 APALARA Ra 330/233 Closele Walter Bisselle 609 Apolachicola R.Q. 484-6459 Walte Burelle Fino a principal Kille Apartichilant 488.589) 610 Applachicola Rd. 485-8607 Patricia, J. Boruff Uleck Tol Laguere 77077 89232 10/8 Laguna Gr. 941 525 0916 705 LAGUNA DR -IRL& 941 525 0917 705 LAGUNA KICO 1

EXHIBIT G	EXI	ΗB	IT G
-----------	-----	----	------

We as Venice Island residents do not want more guard rail to be installed along Osprey Street and the Osprey Ditch.

This is a slow speed residential street, that is a straight road with an existing 8inch curb, and with no known past reports of vehicles in the ditch.

Signature Phone/email Name and address 703 APALAchicola RD 485.0715 KLauer 705 apalachicola Rd Judich Fazzelare 424 Baycrest D. Nihi Brand anchony Fazzelone, SR. 637 apalachicola Jane Reston Gu Valentino 424 ALHAMBICA 12D. 649 APAIAchicila RI Thomas 800 MADRID AVE Kaun Williams Gregg Aptelbourn 809 MODAID AK Doyle E Williams M.D TIS & Donal Pr 713 Es parado De Alian Butter 809 Ormond St. Jeth JO Wernyss Beth D Wernss BrioksMathavis 615-2184092

EXHIBIT G

We as Venice Island residents do not want more guard rail to be installed along Osprey Street and the Osprey Ditch.

This is a slow speed residential street, that is a straight road with an existing 8inch curb, and with no known past reports of vehicles in the ditch.

Phone/email Signature Name and address Karen Woods Karen Woods, 609 Madrid Ave - 223-3226 Jim Words Jim Woods, 609 Madrid Ave - 223-8664 Lynn Them Lynn Thierry 812 Ormond St-488-7091 Richard N. RICHARD N. THIERRY 816 ORMOND ST. John & This JOHN THIERRY 816 ORMOND ST DOROTHALEE HAYES 724 CADIZ RD Doro thate H Charlotte Peekkam 228 Caliz Rd HARKIJ flery Smith 736 Callz Rel. DONNE HAINES 713 CADIN NO. Offer Anda Havi, 7.3 Cadi Rd. Zila